



STATE OF NEW JERSEY

**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE
ACTION OF THE
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION**

In the Matter of John Duffy,
Storekeeper 2 (PS5323K),
Department of Human Services

CSC Docket No. 2020-1046

Examination Appeal

ISSUED: January 16, 2020 (RE)

John Duffy appeals the determination of the Division of Agency Services which found that he did not meet the experience requirements for the promotional examination for Storekeeper 2 (PS5323K), Department of Human Services.

The subject examination announcement was issued with a closing date of May 21, 2019. The examination was open to employees in the competitive division who had an aggregate of one year of continuous permanent service as of the closing date as an Assistant Storekeeper OR who were serving in any competitive title and who met the announced requirements. These requirements included three years of experience in stockroom work, including the obtaining, recording, storing, safeguarding and issuing of varied types of equipment, materials and supplies and in maintaining records thereof. The appellant was found to be below the experience requirements. One candidate appears on the eligible list, which has not yet been certified.

The appellant listed the following positions on his application and resume: part-time EMT (12 hours per week) with Dewey Fire and EMS Service; provisional Storekeeper 2 from February 2003 to the May 2019 closing date; EMT (part-time, no hours given, and full-time) with Nazareth EMS; EMT Assistant Supervisor (part-time, no hours given, and full-time) with Lehigh Valley MedTech Ambulance; Safety Person/Lead Division Supervisor with Federal Mogul; Multiple with Easton Hospital; EMT and Road Supervisor with Valley Transport Ambulance Service; Untitled with Lifestar Response Ambulance Service (part-time, no hours given); Untitled with Kutztown Ambulance Transport Services Inc. (part-time, no hours given); Untitled

with Forks Township Emergency Squad (part-time, no hours given); Untitled with T.E.A.M.S. (part-time, no hours given); Untitled with Dewey Fire Company (part-time, no hours given); Untitled with LCCC (part-time, no hours given); Untitled with Tobyhanna Township Volunteer Ambulance (volunteer and part-time, no hours given). He was credited six months of experience in his provisional position, and was found to be lacking two years, six months of experience.

On appeal, the appellant argues that he is a provisional in the subject title, and he resubmits his application and resume.

N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.6(a) provides that applicants shall meet all requirements specified in the promotional examination announcement by the closing date.

CONCLUSION

Initially, it is noted that eligibility for a given examination is determined based on the information provided on the application. The application states, “You may be declared ineligible or you may not receive proper credit for scoring purposes if you do not properly complete your application,” and “Since your application may be your only ‘test paper,’ be sure it is complete and accurate. Failure to complete your application properly may cause you to be declared ineligible, lower your score, or possibly cause you to fail.” The published announcement also clearly specifies the relevant time frames for filing and amending applications.

The appellant did not list his positions with the Department of Human Services separately. While he stated that he was a provisional Storekeeper 2 from February 2003 to the May 2019 closing date, official records are different. They indicate that the appellant was a provisional Storekeeper 2 from December 2018 to May 2019, an Emergency Medical Services Technician from August 2003 to December 2018, a Human Services Assistant from March 2003 to August 2003, and held a temporary Medical appointment from February 2003 to March 2003. He listed his duties for this position as half EMT duties and half Storekeeper 2 duties. Accordingly, he was credited with six months for experience as a Storekeeper 2. His remaining positions were in emergency services. Also, the appellant grouped positions on his resume (EMT and Road Supervisor), did not title positions (Multiple and untitled), and listed duties of multiple positions together.

While as a EMT, the appellant emphasizes that he kept units well supplied. However, this does not match the announced experience requirement. Qualifying experience has the announced experience as the primary focus. The amount of time, and the importance of the duty, determines if it is the primary focus. An experience requirement that lists a number of duties which define the primary experience, requires that the applicants demonstrate that they primarily performed all of those duties for the required length of time. Performance of only one or some of the duties

listed is not indicative of comprehensive experience. *See In the Matter of Jeffrey Davis* (MSB, decided March 14, 2007). As a Safety Person/Lead Division Supervisor with Federal Mogul the appellant was Safety Chairman for seven warehouses. It is unclear what the appellant means when he says he was lead person or supervisor for various locations, special projects and equipment. He states that he pulled, packed and shipped customer orders. He replaced restocking orders, oversaw inventory control, and did various types of recordkeeping. However, this does not indicate that he was obtaining and issuing varied types of equipment, materials and supplies. He description of this/these positions are vague and do not encompass the scope of the required experience. The appellant possesses six months of experience in his provisional position as a Storekeeper 2 and his remaining experience is inapplicable. Therefore, he lacks two years, six months of supervisory experience.

The appellant was denied admittance to the subject examination since he lacked the minimum requirements in experience. An independent review of all material presented indicates that the decision of Agency Services, that the appellant does not meet the announced requirements for eligibility by the closing date, is amply supported by the record. The appellant provides no basis to disturb this decision. Thus, the appellant has failed to support his burden of proof in this matter.

ORDER

Therefore, it is ordered that this appeal be denied.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON
THE 15th DAY OF JANUARY, 2020



Deirdré L. Webster Cobb
Chairperson
Civil Service Commission

Inquiries
and
Correspondence

Christopher S. Myers
Director
Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs
Civil Service Commission
Written Record Appeals Unit
P. O. Box 312
Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

c: John Duffy
Debra Sharpe
Kelly Glenn
Records Center